

### Raising the Hands and Saying "Aameen" Aloud

Q: Salaah-576: As Salaamu Alaykum wa Rahmatullaahi wa Barakaatuh dear Mufti Sahib. You have provided a fantastic and extremely well-researched reply to the question of Taqleed. The reply addresses the doubts anyone may have on the subject. May Allaah reward you abundantly.

The question however also mentioned raising the hands (when saying the Takbeer) and saying "Aameen" aloud. You however did not elaborate on these aspects. It would be a great source of guidance if you could shed light on these two topics as well. Does the quoted extract really appear in Hidaayah?

Answer: I am thankful from the bottom of my heart for your query. May Allaah reward you. I shall presently explain the extract from Hidaayah and present a brief synopsis of the two issues so that the stance of the Hanafis may become apparent. The person posing the question asserts that Rasulullaah SAW. as well as the Khulafaa Raashideen raised their hands during salaah and has quoted from Hidaayah (Vol.1 Pg.379) that Rasulullaah SAW. did so until the day he passed away. The issue of saying "Aameen" aloud is also discussed in Hidaayah (Vol.1 Pg.362). The questioner has unsuccessfully used these two extracts to prove that raising the hands and saying "Aameen" aloud have been proven as being the Sunnah practice. He has however omitted to quote the words used before and after the said extracts, making it illegitimate to attribute the words to the author of Hidaayah. With regard to raising the hands, Hidaayah states: "The hands will not be raised except for the first Takbeer, as opposed to the practice of Imaam Shaafi'ee RAH. who says that it should be raised when proceeding for Ruku and getting up from it. This is on account of the statement of Rasulullaah SAW. that the hands should be raised only on seven occasions, viz. when starting the salaah, before reciting the Qunoot, when performing the Eia salaahs and the remaining four ate on the occasion of Hajj. The narration that speaks about raising the hands refers to the practice during the beginning stages of Islaam (which was later forsaken)."

The marginal note of this text states that when Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Zubayr RADI. once saw a person raising his hands when proceeding for Ruku and when getting up from it, he approached him after the salaah, saying, "Do not do that because although Rasulullaah SAW. used to do it initially, he later stopped.

As for the text of Hidaayah addressing the issue of reciting Aameen loudly, it states that when the Imaam recites (GAYRIL MAGDUBI ALAYHIM WAD DOLLEEN) he should say ("Aameen"). The Muqtadi should say this as well, but should do so silently because of a Hadith of Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood RADI. which states that there are four things that the Imaam should say silently. Amongst these are the Ta'awwudh, the Tasmiya and the'Aameen'. This is because this is a du'aa and du'aas are to be recited silently.

Any person is at liberty to refer to the relevant texts of Hidaayah and see for himself that nothing

has been stated of what the questioner has quoted. What slander has been directed to the author of Hidaayah. We shall now shed further light on these two issues.

Rafa Yadain (Raising the Hands)

Calm and composure are the hallmarks of salaah and Rasulullaah SAW. has specially instructed that they be adopted in salaah. The acceptance of the salaah is therefore directly proportional to the level of composure the Musalli adopts. During the early days of Islaam, there were certain acts conflicting with calm and composure that had been allowed during salaah. Some of these are greeting with the hand, replying to a greeting, talking during salaah and looking about while performing salaah. These acts were gradually prohibited afterwards. Such was the situation with raising the hands.

Ahadeeth prove that apart from the time when he started the salaah, Rasulullaah SAW. used to raise the hands when proceeding for Ruku, when getting up from Ruku, when proceeding for Sajdah, when getting up from the Sajdah and even when getting up for the third Rakaah.

However, raising the hands before and after the Sajdahs as well as when getting up had been gradually stopped and this is accepted even by those who advocate Rafa Yadain. It was only the raising of the hands at the time of Takbeer Tahreema that was maintained.

The stance of the Hanafi Madh'hab conforms perfectly with the Ahadeeth. Amongst the many Ahadeeth substantiating this view will now be quoted.

Tirmidhi reports that Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood RADI. once told the people, "Should I not show you the salaah as Rasulullaah SAW. performed it?" He then proceeded to perform the salaah and did not raise his hands except at the beginning of the salaah. Imaam Tirmidhi RAH. classifies the Hadith as Hasan and goes on to state that similar reports have been quoted from Hadhrat Baraa bin Aazib RADI. and that this is the opinion of many scholars from amongst the Sahabah RADI. and Tabi'een, amongst whom is Hadhrat Sufyaan Thowri RAH. and the scholars of Kufa.

Abu Dawood quotes the Hadith from Hadhrat Baraa bin Aazib RADI. who says, "Rasulullaah SAW. raised his hands close to the ears when he started the salaah and not again.

Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood RADI. was Rasulullaah SAW.'s confidante and was always close to Rasulullaah SAW., because of which he knew well the actions of Rasulullaah SAW. Since he stood behind Rasulullaah SAW. his word on the method of Rasulullaah SAW.'s salaah is a very strong proof.

It has also been reported that when Hadhrat Ali RADI. performed salaah, he raised his hands only when he began the salaah and not again. Since Ahadeeth concerning raising the hands (several times during salaah) have been reported from Hadhrat Ali RADI. as well as Ahadeeth like the above which advocate raising the hands only once, it follows that Hadhrat Ali RADI. understood that Rasulullaah SAW. had later stopped raising the hands.

It has also been reported that Hadhrat Umar RADI. used to raise his hands only when he began

the salaah and not again. This Hadith is Sohih.<sup>3</sup> Furthermore, although several Ahadeeth concerning raising the hands (several times during salaah) have been reported from Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar RADI, narrations prove that he raised his hands only at the beginning. Such narrations have been reported from Hadhrat Mujaahid RAH. and Abdul Azeez bin Hakeem RAH. This also proves that he knew that the action had been abrogated.

### A DIALOGUE BETWEEN IMAAM ABU HANEEFAH RAH. AND IMAAM AWZAA'EE (RAH.) CONCERNING RAFA YADAIN

Hadhrat Sufyaan bin Uyaynah RAH. reports that Imaam Abu Haneefah RAH. and Imaam Awzaa'ee RAH. once met at a granary in Makkah when the following dialogue ensued:

Imaam Awzaa'ee RAH. What is the matter with you people who do not raise your hands when proceeding for Ruku and when getting up from it?

Imaam Abu Haneefah RAH. Because there are no authentic narrations from Rasulullaah SAW. to prove it.

Imaam Awzaa'ee RAH. : What do you mean by no authentic narrations when Zuhri RAH. has narrated to me from Saalim RAH., who in turn narrates from his father (Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar RADI. that Rasulullaah SAW. raised his hands when he started the salaah, when proceeding for Ruku and when getting up from it?

Imaam Abu Haneefah RAH. :Well, Hammaad RAH. has narrated to us from Ibraheem RAH., who in turn narrates from Alqama RAH., Aswad RAH. and Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood RADI. that Rasulullaah SAW. raised his hands when he commenced the salaah and did not repeat himself thereafter.

Imaam Awzaa'ee RAH. : I am narrating to you from Zuhri RAH., Saalim RAH. and his father and you tell me that you narrate from Hammaad RAH. and Ibraheem RAH.

Imaam Abu Haneefah RAH.: Hammaad RAH. was a greater Faqih (had a deeper understanding) than Zuhri RAH. and Ibraheem RAH. was a greater Faqih than Saalim RAH. Alqama RAH. was no less a personality in Fiqh than Abdullaah bin Umar RADI. and while Abdullaah bin Umar RADI. was a Sahabi and had the honour of being such, Aswad RAH. also had many honours to his credit. As for Abdullaah bin Mas'ood RADI. he was Abdullaah bin Mas'ood RADI.

Imaam Awzaa'ee RAH. then held his peace.

### THE STATEMENT OF MOULANA THANAA'ULLAAH AMRITSARI WHO WAS THE LEADER OF THE GHAYR MUQALLIDEEN

"According to our practice, Rafa Yadain is a Mustahab act for which one will be rewarded if done and which will not at all affect the salaah if not done.

It is therefore futile for the Ghayr Muqallideen to make an issue of the Rafa Yadain question and to insult the standpoint of the Hanafis, which complies perfectly with the Ahadeeth.

### AAMEEN BIL JAHAR (SAYING 'AAMEEN' LOUDLY)

During the early days of Islaam, Rasulullaah SAW. taught the Sahabah RADI. both verbally and practically. For example, while it is known that the du'aa in the Janaazah salaah is recited silently, there are Ahadeeth to prove that Rasulullaah SAW. recited it audibly as well. This was to teach the Sahabah RADI. Therefore, Hadhrat Auf bin Maalik RAH. reports that he learnt the du'aa for the Janaazah salaah when Rasulullaah SAW. recited it audibly.

Similarly, although the Qiraa'ah of the Zuhr and Asr salaahs is silent. Rasulullaah SAW. sometimes recited a portion of a verse audibly so that the Sahabah RADI. would know what Surah he was reciting.

Like these, there are many other examples and reciting 'Aameen' audibly is another. Allaama Anwar Shah Kashmeeri RAH. writes that Rasulullaah SAW. recited 'Aameen' loudly to teach the Sahabah RADI. and this is substantiated by a Hadith reported by Haafidh Abu Bishr Dowlaabi RAH. in his Asmaa wal kuna tual (Vol.1 Pg. 197). In this narration, Hadhrat Waa'il bin Hujar radi. says, "After reciting (GAYRIL MAGDUBI ALAYHIM WALD DOLLEEN) Rasulullaah SAW. said ('Aameen') loudly. I think that Rasulullaah SAW. recited 'Aameen' loudly to teach us.

Once the Sahabah RADI. had learnt to say 'Aameen' after Surah Faatiha, Rasulullaah SAW. started saying it silently. A narration of Tirmidhi therefore states that after reciting (GAYRIL MAGDUBI ALAYHIM WAD DOLLEEN) Rasulullaah SAW. said ('Aameen') silently. Another narration from Hadhrat Waail RADI. state that he performed salaah behind Rasulullaah SAW. and observed that after reciting (GAYRIL MAGDUBI ALAYHIM WAD DOLLEEN) Rasulullaah SAW. said ('Aameen') silently. Haakim has reported this narration and declared it to be Sahih accorditrg to the definition of Imaams Bukhaari RAH. and Muslim RAH. A similar narration appears in Ahmad, Abu Dawood, Tayaalisi, Abu Ya'la, Tabraani and Daar Qutni.

Another narration states that both Hadhrat Umar RADI. and Hadhrat Ali RADI. recited the 'Bismillaah (before Surah Faatiha) and 'Aameen' silently.

Abdur Razzaaq reports from Hadhrat Ibraheem Nakha'es RAH. that five things should be recited silently viz. Thanaa, Ta'awwudh, Tasmiya, Aameen and Tahmeed (ALLHUMM RABBNA LAKAL HAMD) Abdur Razzaaq also reports that Hadhrat Ibraheem RAH. also recited the Aameen silently.

Hadhrat Ibraheem RAH. reports from Hadhrat umar RADI. that that four things should be recited silently, viz. Ta'awwudh. Tasmiya, Aameen and Tahmeed (ALLAHUMM LAKAL HAMD) Such was the practice of Hadhrat Umar RADI. Hadhrat Ali RADI., Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood RADI., Hadhrat Ibraheem RAH., majority of the Sahabah RADI. and Taabi'een. as well as the scholars of Kufa.

Hadhrat Sheikhul Islaam Moulana Sayyid Husayn Ahmad Madani RAH. says that it was the practice of the Khulafaa Raashideen such as Hadhrat Umar RADI. and Hadhrat Ali RADI. and the senior Sahabah RADI. such as Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood RADI. to say Aameen silently. Had this not been the practice of Rasulullaah SAW. these Sahabah RADI. would never have done so. He also states that Rasulullaah SAW. recited Aameen loudly either (1) to show that it is permissible, (2) to teach the Ummah or because it was permissible during the early days of Islaam, after which it was abrogated. This is substantiated by a narration of Tabraani

stating that Rasulullaah SAW. repeated Aameen thrice and the narration which Haafidh Abu Bishr Dowlaabi RAH. in his Asmaa wal Kuna (Vol.1 Pg.197). In this narration, Hadhrat Waa'il bin Hujar RADI., says, "After reciting (GAYRIL- MAGDUBI ALAYHIM WAD DOLLEEN) Rasulullaah SAW. said ('Aameen') loudly. I think that Rasulullaah SAW. recited 'Aameen' loudly to teach us." This proves that while the actual Sunnah was to recite it silently, Rasulullaah sometimes did so audibly to teach the Ummah, just as he at times did with the Thanaa and Tashahhud. Furthermore, Hadhrat Waa'il bin Hujar silently and loudly because he performed salaah behind Rasulullaah SAW. both in the early days of Islaam and later during the latter days. Had Rasulullaah SAW.'s final practice been to say the Aameen loudly, personalities like Hadhrat Umar RADI. and Hadhrat Ali RADI. would never have forsaken the practice.

### ANOTHER PROOF FOR SAYING AAMEEN SILENTLY

All are unanimous that 'Aameen' is not part of Surah Faatiha or the Qur'aan, because of which it is not written in the Qur'aan. It is a du'aa and du'aas are to be recited silently according to the verse of the Qur'aan in which Allaah says, "Call to your Rabb in humility and quietly". This further proves that 'Aameen' ought to be silent. Another factor proving that it ought to be silent is the fact that Aameen is one of the du'aas of salaah and should be recited silently like them. Like the Ta'awwudh which is also not part of the Qur'aan, the Aameen needs to be recited silently. Imaam Tirmidhi RAH. has also noted a few errors in the narration of Hadhrat Shu'ba RAH. These are (1) his narration gives the name Hujar Abul Amba, whereas it ought to be Hujar Ibnul Amba, (2) he names him as Abul Amba, whereas he was really known as Abus Sakan, (3) he mentions an addition made by Alqama whereas Alqama does not feature in the chain of narrators.

The reply to these arguments are:

- (1) Hadhrat Hujar's father and son were named Amba, which is common amongst the Arabs, making him both Abul Amba and Ibnul Amba.
- (2) He was known as both Abul Amba as well as Abus Sakan because a person can have more than one title
- (3) Hujar heard the narration from both Hadhrat Alqama RAH. and Hadhrat Waa'il RADI. Therefore, Abu Dawood Tayaalisi has specifically quoted him as saying that he heard the narration from both persons.

### WHY THE NARRATION OF SHU'BA BE GIVEN PREFERENCE

While Sufyaan RAH. is a Mudallas, Shu'ba RAH. is not. The narration of Sufyaan therefore becomes Mu'an'an, while that of Shu'ba RAH. does not. Shu'ba's narration is therefore given preference. Furthermore, Shu'ba RAH. has profound knowledge of the words of the Ahadeeth as well as the narrators of the Ahadeeth, while Sufyaan RAH. was proficient in Fiqh. This is the opinion of Yahya bin Sa'eed. Hamaad bin Salama, Ahmad bin Hambal, Abu Dawood RAH. and others. In fact, even Sufyaan RAH. had stated that Shu'ba RAH. was the Ameerul Mu'mineen as far as Ahadeeth are concerned.

Since this discussion pertains to the words and narrators of Ahadeeth, it is obvious that the narration of Shu'ba RAH. should receive preference.

Furthermore, Shu'ba RAH. himself stated that he would have went more than once to a person from whom he has narrated a Hadith. If he narrated ten narrations from a person, he would have been to the person more than ten times. He therefore heard a narration from a person several times, because of which he was unlikely to err. This was unlike Sufyaan RAH. Another factor lending weight to the narration of Shu'ba RAH. is the fact that Sufyaan RAH. himself did not practice according to the narration he reported, meaning that he did not regard it as being the correct practice.

And Allaah knows best what is most correct.

Fatawa Rahimiyyah vol.2