

Qiraa'ah Khalfal Imaam" (Reciting Qiraa'ah while Following the Imaam)

Q: Salaah-575: The Ghayr Muqallideen regard Qiraa'ah Khalfal Imaam as Fardh (obligatory) and prove their point by quoting the Hadith: "There is no salaah for the one who does not recite the opening of the Kitaab (surah Faatiha)." They claim that the Hanafis oppose this Hadith and also say that one cannot contradict a Hadith that appears in Bukhaari and Muslim. People are now in doubt. We would therefore appreciate a detailed reply in the light of the Qur'aan and the Ahadeeth, especially quoting the proofs of the Hanafis and their replies to the others. Your reply will be a cause of guidance and will inshaa Allaah dispel the wrong notions of the masses.

Answer: This issue is a point of great contention and difference of opinion. One cannot prove himself by presenting only a portion of a Hadith because a decision can be made only by studying all the various Ahadeeth.

The Hadith you quoted refers to the salaah of a person performing salaah by himself (and applies also to an Imaam). It does not refer to the salaah of a Muqtadi. The following is an extract from Sahih Tirmidhi from the famous Muhaddith and Mujtahid Imaam Ahmad bin Hambal RAH.

Imaam Ahmad RAH states that when Rasulullaah SAW. said, "There is no salaah for the one who does not recite the opening of the Kitaab" he was referring to the person performing salaah by himself. He proves this point by quoting a Hadith in which Hadhrat Jaabir RADI. said, "Whoever performs a Rakaah without reciting the mother of the Qur'aan (Surah Faatiha) has performed no salaah unless he is behind an Imaam." Here we have a companion of Rasulullaah SAW. interpreting the words "There is no salaah for the one who does not recite the opening of the Kitaab" as a person performing salaah individually.

Although this narration quotes the words of Hadhrat Jaabir RADI. a narration of Tahaawi quotes the words from Rasulullaah SAW. himself. Imaam Abu Dawood RAH. has reported that even according to Hadhrat Sufyaan bin Uyayna RAH. the Hadith refers to a person who performs salaah by himself. The stance of the Hanafis therefore conforms with the Ahadeeth and the narrations of the Sahabah RADI. and Taabi'een.

The Qur'aan states: "When the Qur'aan is recited, then listen attentively to it and remain silent so that mercy may be shown to you.

The chief of the Mufasssireen Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Abbaas RADI. and Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mughaffal RADI. both state that this verse refers to the Fardh (obligatory) salaah. Allaama Ibn Kaatheer RAH. adds further that the same interpretation has been stated by Hadhrat Mujaahid RAH. as quoted by Hadhrat Sufyaan Thowri RAH. and several other scholars. In fact, the same opinion is shared by Hadhrat Sa'eed bin Jubayr RAH. Hadhrat Dahhaak RAH. Hadhrat Qataadah RAH. Hadhrat Ibraheem Nahka'ee RAH. Hadhrat Sha'bi RAH. Hadhrat Suddi RAH. and Hadhrat Abdur Rahmaan bin Zaid bin Aslam RAH.

Ma'aalimut Tanzeel states. "Hadhrat Abu Hurayrah RADI. reports that this verse was revealed because some Sahabah RADI. used to recite loudly when they followed Rasulullaah SAW. in salaah ... When Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood RADI. heard some people reciting as they followed the Imaam, he turned to them after the salaah and said, "Has the time still not arrived for you to understand the verse: ' When the Qur'aan is recited, then listen attentively to it and remain silent so that mercy may be shown to you". Hadhrat Hasan RAH. Hadhrat Zuhri RAH. and Hadhrat Ibraheem Nakha'ee RAH. have stated that this verse refers to salaah." Imaam Ahmad RAH. has stated. "People are unanimous about the fact that this verse refers to salaah. Imaam Zaid bin Aslam RAH. and Hadhrat Abul Aaliya RAH. said, "Because some Sahabah RADI. used to recite loudly when they followed Rasulullaah SAW. in salaah, Allaah revealed the verse: When the Qur'aan is recited, then listen attentively to it (stop talking) and remain silent so that mercy may be shown to you."

The Tafseer of Ibn Katheer (Vol.3 Pg.623) also quotes a narration stating that when Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood RADI. heard some people reciting as they followed the Imaam, he turned to them after the salaah and said, "Has the time still not arrived for you to understand the Allaah's command when He says: ' When- the Qur'aan is recited, then listen attentively to it and remain silent so that mercy may be shown to you".

The following is stated in the book Al Ikhtiyaar: "A Muqtadi will not recite Qiraa'ah during the salaah because Allaah states: 'When the Qur'aan is recited, then listen attentively to it and remain silent so that mercy may be shown to you." This is because Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood RADI., Hadhrat Abu Hurayrah RADI. and many Mufasssireen state that the verse was revealed when some Sahabah RADI. used to recite loudly when they followed Rasulullaah SAW. in salaah.

The book Zujaajatul Masaabeeh (Vol.1 Pg.241) also quotes several narrations in this regard. All of the above make it clear that the Muqtadi should remain silent while the Imaam is reciting the Qiraa'ah in both audible and silent salaahs. The verse of the Qur'aan gives two explicit commands. The first is the command to listen attentively (to the recitation of the Imaam), which refers especially to the audible salaahs. The second is the command to remain silent (while the Imaam is reciting), which refers to both silent and audible salaahs.

AHADEETH ON THE SUBJECT

1. Hadhrat Abu Moosa Ash'ari RADI. says, "Rasulullaah SAW. delivered a sermon in which he

explained the Sunnah to us as well as the manner of performing salaah. He said, 'When you stand up for salaah, form your rows with one of you as the Imaam. When he calls out the Takbeer Tahreema, you also follow suit, but when he recites, you remain silent. Then, you say 'Aameen' when he recites:

(GAYRIL MAGDUBI ALAYHIM WALD? DOWL LEEN)

This Hadith is narrated in Muslim (Vol.1 Pg.174). When one of Imaam Muslim RAH.'s students asked him whether the narration of Imaam Sulaymaan Taymi RAH. was authentic, which states that Rasulullaah SAW. added, "When he (the Imaam) recites, then you (the Muqtadi) remain silent." To this, Imaam Muslim RAH. replied, "Do you wish to know of someone with a memory better than Sulaymaan's?" This indicates that even though Imaam Sulaymaan RAH. was the only one to narrate the addition, his narration is perfectly authentic.

In reality, however, there are other narrations of reliable narrators that are the same as that of Hadhrat Sulaymaan Taymi RAH. Moulana Zafar Ahmad Thanwi A has narrated a report from Sahih Abu Awaana, which is narrated from Abdullaah bin Rushayd, who then narrates from Abu Ubaydah (Mujaa'ah bin Zuhayr Atki), Qataadah, Yunus bin Jubayr, Hattaah bin Abdullaah Raqaashi and then Hadhrat Abu Moosa Ash'ari RADI. This narration also states that Rasulullaah SAW. said, "but when the Imaam recites, you remain silent. Then, you say 'Aameen' when he recites:

(GAYRIL MAGDUBI ALAYHIM WALD DOLLEEN)

The narrator Abu Ubaydah RAH. is a reliable narrator and Ansaab Sam'aani states that the narrations of both Abdullaah bin Rushayd RAH. and Abu Ubaydah RAH. are reliable.

Daar Qutni has also reported the narration in his Sunan. In his narration, Umar bin Aamir and Sa'eed bin Abu Urwa RAH. have narrated from Qataadah RAH. a report like that of Sulaymaan Taymi RAH. This narration also adds: "...but when the Imaam recites, you remain silent." Imaam Muslim RAH. narrates from Umar bin Aamir RAH. as well as from his student Saalim bin Nooh RAH. Apart from Imaam Muslim RAH., Imaam Aby Khuzaymah RAH. and Ibn Hibbaan RAH. also narrate from him. The belief of certain Muhadditheen that only Sulaymaan Taymi RAH. has reported the addition is therefore wrong. It has also been reported from three students of Qataadah RAH. all of whom are reliable narrators.

2. The following is quoted from Nasa'ee: "Interpreting the verse 'When the Qur'aan is recited, then listen attentively to it and remain silent so that mercy may be shown to you.'", Hadhrat Abu

Hurayrah RADI. said, 'Rasulullaah SAW. said, 'The Imaam has been appointed to be followed. so call out the Takbeer Tahreema when he does. be silent when he recites the Qiraa'ah and say (ALLAAHUMMA RABBNA LAKAL HAMD) when he says (SAMI ALLAHULIMAN HAMID)

3. Ibn Maajah narrates: "Hadhrat Abu Hurayrah RADI. narrates that Rasulullaah SAW. said, The Imaam has been appointed to be followed, so call out the Takbeer Tahreema when he does, be silent when he recites the Qiraa'ah, Say (Aamee) when he says GAYRIL MAGDUBI ALAYHIM WALAD DOLLEEN. and say ALLAHUMMA RABBANA LAKAL HAMD. when he says SAMI ALLAA HULIMAN HAMID. Both the narrations of Nasa'ee and Ibn Maajah are authentic. When a student of Imaam Muslim RAH. called Abu Bakr RAH. and asked him about the narration of Hadhrat Abu Hurayrah RADI. he replied that it was authentic.³ This Hadith makes it clear that the Muqtadi should not recite anything behind the Imaam. It has also become clear that the Hadith clarifies the verse When the Qur'aan is recited, then listen attentively to it and remain silent so that mercy may be shown to you."

4. Tirmidhi reports that Hadhrat Jaabir RADI. said, "Whoever performs a Rakaah without reciting the mother of the Qur'aan (Surah Faatiha) has performed no salaah unless he is behind an Imaam." Imaam Tirmidhi RAH. adds that the narration is Hasan Sahih. Imaam Tahaawi RAH. narrates the same Hadith from Rasulullaah SAW. said, "Whoever performs a Rakaah without reciting the mother of the Qur'aan (Surah Faatiha) has performed no salaah unless he is behind an Imaam.

This narration mentions specifically that it is not Waajib (compulsory) for the Muqtadi to recite Surah Faatiha when following the Imaam.

The Mu'atta of Imaam Maalik RAH. states: „Hadhrat Naafi RAH. reports that when Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar RADI. was asked whether a Muqtadi should recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam, he replied. 'When any of you performs salaah behind an Imaam, the recitation of the Imaam suffices for him as well. However, when he performs salaah by himself, he should recite the Qiraa'ah.' Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar RADI. himself would not recite any Qiraa'ah when following an Imaam.

Zujaa'iatul Masaabeeh (Vol.1 Pg.251) states: "Allaama Ayni RAH. said, 'Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar RADI. would not recite the Qiraa'ah when following an Imaam and he was one who followed most closely in the footsteps of Rasulullaah SAW.

7. Ibn Maajah reports from Hadhrat Jaabir RADI. that Rasulullaah SAW. said, "If one has an

Imaam, then the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam is his Qiraa'ah as well."

8. The Musnad of Imaam Abu Haneefah RAH. states: "Hadhrat Jaabir RADI. reports that Rasulullaah SAW. said, 'If one has an Imaam, then the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam is his Qiraa'ah as well.'"

9. The Mu'atta of Imaam Muhammad RAH. states: Imaam Abu Haneefah RAH. reported to us from Abul Hasan Moosa bin Abu Aa'isha RAH. from Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Shaddaad RAH. from Hadhrat Jaabir bin Abdullaah RADI. that Rasulullaah SAW. said, "If one has an Imaam, then the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam is his Qiraa'ah as well."

10. Zujaajatul Masaabeeh (Vol.1 Pg.248) states: "Hadhrat Jaabir RADI. reports that Rasulullaah SAW, said, 'If one has an Imaam, then the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam is his Qiraa'ah as well.' This has been narrated by Imaam Muhammad RAH. Daar Qutni RAH. and Bayhaqi RAH. from our Imaam Abu Haneefah RAH. , a chain of narrators that is most authentic. In fact, Allaama Ibn Humaam RAH. has asserted that the narration conforms with the standards of authenticity used by Imaam Bukhaari RAH. and Imaam Muslim RAH. Allaama Ayni RAH. says, "The narration is authentic. As for Imaam Abu Haneefah RAH., he was after all, Imaam Abu Haneefah RAH. Moosa bin Abu Aa'isha RAH. is amongst the reliable and dependable narrators from whom Bukhaari and Muslim narrate. Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Shaddaad RAH. was amongst the leading and most dependable scholars of Shaam. The narration is therefore Sahih."

11. The Mu'atta of Imaam Muhammad RAH. quotes another narration as follows: Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Shaddaad RAH. reports that Rasulullaah SAW. once led the Sahabah RADI., in Asr salaah. When one of the Sahabah RADI. started to recite Qiraa'ah, the Sahabi RADI. beside him indicated to him to remain silent. When the salaah was over, the Sahabi RADI. asked, 'Why did you indicate to me to remain silent? The other replied, 'Rasulullaah SAW. was in front of us and I did not want you to recite behind him. Overhearing this conversation, Rasulullaah SAW. then said, 'If one has an Imaam, then the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam is his Qiraa'ah as well.

12. Kitaabul Aathaar contains the following: "Hadhrat Jaabir RADI. reports that Rasulullaah SAW. was leading the salaah when a Sahabi RADI. started to recite Qiraa'ah. Another Sahabi RADI. stopped him from reciting Qiraa'ah in salaah and a dispute arose between the two, with the first saying, 'Why do you prevent me from reciting Qiraa'ah behind Rasulullaah SAW.?' When their dispute reached Rasulullaah SAW.'s ears, he said, 'If one has an Imaam, then the

Qiraa'ah of the Imaam is his Qiraa'ah as well.'Imaam Muhammad RAH.'It is this practice that we follow and such is the opinion of Imaam Abu Haneefah RAH.

13.Zujaajatul Masaabeeh (Vol.1 Pg.250) reports from Hadhrat Ali RADI. that someone once asked Rasulullaah SAW. "should I recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam or should I remain silent?" "No," Rasulullaah SAW. replied, "you should remain silent because his Qiraa'ah suffices for you.

14. Zujaajatul Masaabeeh (Vol.1 Pg.250) reports another narration from Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Abbaas RADI. in which Rasulullaah SAW. said, "The Qiraa'ah of the Imaam suffices for you, whether he recites silently or audibly." This narration is from Daar Qutni.

15. Muslim reports from Hadhrat Abu Hurayrah RADI. that Rasulullaah? SAW. said, "When the Qaari (reciter of Qiraa'ah, viz. the Imaam) says. GAYRIL MAGDUBI ALAYHI WALAD DOLLEEN. and those following him say, Aameen all their previous sins are forgiven if their (Aameen) corresponds with the? (Aameen) of the angels."
This Hadith refers to performing salaah in Jamaa'ah and refers only to the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam, making it apparent that it is only the Imaam who needs to recite. Had it been necessary for the Muqtadi to recite Qiraa'ah, the Hadith would not have spoken about the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam only. The Hadith also indicates that the responsibility of reciting Surah Faatiha is that of the Imaam.

16.A narration of Bukhaari reports from Hadhrat Abu Hurayrah RADI. that Rasulullaah SAW. said, "When the Qaari (reciter of Qiraa'ah, viz. the Imaam) says'Aameen', you also say'Aameen' because the angels also says 'Aameen' and all the previous sins of a person are forgiven when his 'Aameen' corresponds with that of the angels."
In this Hadith as well, the Qaari refers to the one who recites the Qiraa'ah, which is the Imaam only. If everyone needed to recite Qiraa'ah, Rasulullaah SAW. would have said, "When you all say, (GAYRIL- MAGDUBI ALAYHIM WAD? DOLLEEN) then say, Aameen.

Apart from the above, there are several statements of the Sahabah RADI. and Taabi'een and reports about them to support the stance of the Hanafis. We shall now present these.

REPORTS FROM THE SAHABAH RADI.

Hadhrat Moosa bin Aqaba RAH. says that Rasulullaah SAW., Hadhrat Abu Bakr RADI., Hadhrat Umar RADI. and Hadhrat Uthmaan RADI. all prevented people from reciting Qiraa'ah when following the Imaam.³

Another narration from a Taabi'ee states that Hadhrat Umar RADI. took a pledge from the people that they would not recite Qiraa'ah when following the Imaam.

ABOUT HADHRAT ALI RADI.

Hadhrat Ali RADI., said, "The person who recites when following the Imaam is not upon Fitrah. Hadhrat Ali RADI. also said, "The one who recites when following the Imaam conflicts with Fitrah.

ABOUT HADHRAT ABDULLAAH BIN MAS'OOD RADI.

A man once approached Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood RADI. and asked, "should I recite Qiraa'ah when following an Imaam?" Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood RADI., replied, "Remain silent because there are other things to occupy you when performing salaah (such as contemplating about the commands, promises and warnings in the Qur'aan). The Imaam will do the recitation for you.

Hadhrat Alqama bin Qais RAH., reports that Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood RADI. would not recite Qiraa'ah when following an Imaam, regardless of whether the salaah was silent or audible and whether it was the first two Rakaahs or the second two Rakaahs. However when he performed salaah by himself, he would recite both Surah Faatiha and a Surah in the first two Rakaahs and only Surah Faatiha in the second two Rakaahs.

ABOUT HADHRAT ABDULLAAH BIN ABBAAS RADI.

Hadhrat Abu Hamza RAH. reports that he once asked Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Abbaas RADI. whether he should recite any Qiraa'ah when following the Imaam. "No," came the reply.

ABOUT HADHRAT ABDULLAAH BIN UMAR RADI.

1. Hadhrat Ibn Seereen RAH. reports that he once asked Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar RADI. whether he should recite any Qiraa'ah when following an Imaam. Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar RADI. replied, "You seem to have a large belly. The Qiraa'ah of the Imaam will suffice for you.

2. Hadhrat Zaid bin Aslam RAH. says that Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar RADI. used to prevent people from reciting Qiraa'ah when following the Imaam.

3. Hadhrat Naafi RADI. reports that when someone asked Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar RADI. about reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam, he replied, "The Qiraa'ah of the Imaam will suffice for you.

4. When someone once asked Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar RADI. about reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam, he replied, "The Qiraa'ah of the Imaam will suffice for you.

ABOUT HADHRAT ZAID BIN THAABIT RADI.

Hadhrat Ataa bin Yasaar RAH. narrates that when Hadhrat Zaid bin Thaabit RADI. was asked about reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam, he replied, "Under no circumstances must a person recite when following an Imaam. Imaam Muslim RAH. has also reported this narration.

Hadhrat Dhakwaan RAH. reports that both Hadhrat Zaid bin Thaabit RADI. and Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar RADI. used to prohibit people from reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam.

Hadhrat Ataa bin Yasaar RAH. reports that he heard Hadhrat Zaid bin Thaabit RADI. say, "In no salaah should one recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam.

ABOUT HADHRAT JAABIR BIN ABDULLAAH RADI.

Hadhrat Jaabir said, "Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam should neither take place in audible or silent salaahs. Hadhrat Ubaydullaah bin Muqsim RAH. asked Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar RADI., Hadhrat Zaid bin Thaabit RADI. and Hadhrat Jaabir RADI. about reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam. They all told him that in no salaah should a person recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam. When Hadhrat Ubaydullaah bin Muqsim RAH. asked Hadhrat Jaabir RADI. whether he recited Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam in the Zuhr, and Asr salaahs, he replied in the negative.

ABOUT HADHRAT ALQAMA BIN QAIS RAH.

Hadhrat Ibraheem Nakha'ee RAH. reports that Hadhrat Alqama bin Qais RAH. said, "I would prefer biting on a burning charcoal rather than reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam. Hadhrat Ibraheem Nakha'ee RAH. reports that Hadhrat Alqama bin Qais RAH. never recited Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam regardless of whether the salaah was silent or audible, whether it was the second two Rakaahs, whether it was Surah Faatiha or any other Surah.

ABOUT HADHRAT MUHAMMAD BIN SEEREEN RADI.

Hadhrat Muhammad bin Seereen RAH. said, "As far as I know, reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam is not Sunnah.

ABOUT HADHRAT SUWAYD BIN GHAFALA RADI.

Hadhrat Waleed bin Qais RAH. reports that when he asked Hadhrat Suwayd bin Ghafala RAH. (an eminent Taabi'ee whom some even regard as a Sahabi) about reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam in the Zuhr and Asr salaahs. he replied that it should not be done.

ABOUT HADHRAT IBRAHEEM NAKHA'EE RAH.

Hadhrat Mansoor RAH. reports that Hadhrat Ibraheem Nakha'ee RAH.) said, "The first person to read Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam was someone against whom many accusations have been levelled (someone not perfectly reliable).

Moulana Zafar Ahmad Thanwi RAH. writes that Hadhrat Ibraheem Nakha'ee RAH. was amongst the leading Fuqahaa of Kufa and the first person to start reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam was most probably some Khaariji or Qadri. Whereas the people of Kufa always followed the teachings of Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood RADI. and would not recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam, it was this person who introduced it to the people of Kufa. The statement of Hadhrat Ibraheem Nakha'ee RAH. does not however mean that the people of Makkah and Hraaz who recited Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam were perpetrators of Bid'ah and people who stood accused of wrong.

Apart from the above. there are many other narrations, which we have omitted.

Zujaajatul Masaabeeh states that the verse of the Qur'aan gives two explicit commands. The first is the command to listen attentively (to the recitation of the Imaam), which refers especially to the audible salaahs. The second is the command to remain silent (while the Imaam is reciting), which refers to the silent salaahs. It is this practice that has been adopted by Imaam Abu Haneefah RAH. and his companions and has been stated by Hadhrat Jaabir bin Abdullaah RADI., Hadhrat Zaid bin Thaabit RADI. Hadhrat Ali RADI. Hadhrat Umar RADI., Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood RADI. Hadhrat Sufyaan Thowri RAH., Hadhrat Sufyaan bin Uyayna RAH. Hadhrat Ibn Abi Layla RAH., Hadhrat Hasan bin Saalih RAH., Hadhrat Ibraheem Nakha'ee RAH. and the students of Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood RADI., together with other eminent Sahabah RADI. and Taabi'een RAH. This has been stated by Ibn Abdul Birr in his istidhkaar wat Tamheed. Allaama Ayni RAH. has also reported that more than eighty eminent Sahabah RADI. have prohibited people from reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam and their names have been cited by the Muhadditheen. Amongst them are Hadhrat Ali RADI. and the three Abdullaahs (Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood RADI. Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar RADI. and Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Abbaas RADI.). It has also been stated that more than eighty people issued Fataawaa to this effect during that period of time and their unanimity is on the status of Ijmaa. Imaam Abdullaah bin Ya'qoob Haarithi Sabdhoomi RAH. writes in his book Kashful Asraar that Hadhrat Zaid bin Aslam RADI. said, "Ten Sahabah RADI. of Rasulullaah SAW. vehemently prohibited people from reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam. They were Hadhrat Abu Bakr RADI., Hadhrat Umar RADI., Hadhrat Uthmaan RADI., Hadhrat Ali RADI., Hadhrat Abdur Rahman bin Auf RADI., Hadhrat Sa'd bin Abi Waqqaas RADI., Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood RADI., Hadhrat Zaid bin Thaabit RADI., Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar RADI. and Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Abbaas RADI.

The book Ikhtiyaar states "A Muqtadi will not recite Qiraa'ah during the salaah because Allaah states: 'When the Qur'aan is recited, then listen attentively to it and remain silent so that mercy may be shown to you.'" This is because Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood RADI., Hadhrat Abu Hurayrah RADI. and many Mufasssireen state that the verse was explicitly revealed when some Sahabah RADI. used to recite loudly as they followed Rasulullaah SAW. in salaah. It has also been reported from Hadhrat Abu Hurayrah RADI. that Rasulullaah SAW. said, 'The Imaam has been appointed to be followed, so be silent when he recites the Qiraa'ah.' Rasulullaah SAW. also said, 'When a person follows an Imaam, the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam suffices for him.,

Imaam Sha'bi RADI. has also reported that Rasulullaah SAW. said, 'No Qiraa'ah should be recited when following an Imaam.

Rasaa'ilul Arkaan (Vol.1 Pg.101) states that the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam suffices for the follower according to the Hanafi, Hambali and Maaliki schools of jurisprudence. The proof stems from the Hadith of Hadhrat Jaabir RADI. in which Rasulullaah SAW. said, "When a person has an Imaam, then the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam is his Qiraa'ah as well." This Hadith is Sahih (authentic) and has been narrated by Imaam Abu Haneefah RAH. Imaam Muhammad RAH. has stated in his Mu'atta that Imaam Abu Haneefah RAH. has reported it to him and Ibn Adi RAH. has also reported it through his own chain of narrators from Imaam Abu Haneefah RAH. Allaama Ibn Jowzi RAH. has ruled that the narration is Sahih. The details have been elaborated upon in Fat'hul Qadeer together with the chains of narrators. Both chains of narrators end at Rasulullaah SAW., the one from Imaam Abu Haneefah RAH. being the more authentic of the two. Our practice in this matter has proven from the practices of eminent Sahabah RADI.

Haafidh Ibn Taymiyyah RAH. whom the Ghayr Muqallideen claim to follow, writes, "The issue is a bone of contention from both camps, but those who prohibit reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam are the majority of scholars from the past and the present. They have the Qur'aan and authentic Ahadeeth to back their claim whereas those who claim that it is Waajib (compulsory) for the Muqtadi to recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam have in their support Ahadeeth that the A'immah have declared to be weak. Tafseer Haqqaani reports a narration from Hadhrat Abu Hurayrah RADI. stating that after leading the salaah on one occasion, Rasulullaah SAW. asked the Sahabah RADI. anyone had recited Qiraa'ah behind him. When the Sahabah RADI. replied that someone did, Rasulullaah SAW. remarked, I did feel that someone was wrestling with me in reciting." From that day onwards, the Sahabah RADI. no longer recited Qiraa'ah behind Rasulullaah SAW. in the audible salaahs. Tirmidhi has declared the Hadith as Hasan. The same type of narration has been reported from Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood RADI., Hadhrat Imraan bin Husayn RADI. and Hadhrat Jaabir bin Abdullaah RADI.

Muslim has also reported a narration in which Rasulullaah SAW. said, "The Imaam has been appointed to be followed..." This Hadith adds that Rasulullaah SAW. also said, "...so be silent when he recites the Qiraa'ah." Furthermore, Hadhrat Jaabir RADI. said, "Whoever performs a Rakaah without reciting the mother of the Qur'aan (Surah Faatiha) has performed no salaah unless he is behind an Imaam." This Hadith has been declared to be Hasan Sahih. Imaam Tahaawi RAH. has reported these words from Rasulullaah SAW. and several Muhadditheen including Imaams Ahmad RAH. and Maafik RAH. have also reported it.

Apart from the above. there are several other narrations from Imaam Muhammad RAH. and Ibn Abi Shaybah RAH. substantiating the view that reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam is prohibited. It is in view of all of this that Imaam Abu Haneefah RAH. has instructed Muqtadis to remain silent when following the Imaam. Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood RADI. Hadhrat Jaabir RADI.

and Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar RADI. also did not recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam. Imaam Shaafi'ee RAH. and other Muhadditheen have emphasised the recitation of Surah Faatiha. However, they say that the Muqtadi will recite it only when the Imaam pauses after reciting it first. They prove their opinion by quoting a Hadith in which Rasulullaah SAW. said. "Whoever performs salaah without reciting the mother of the Qur'aan, his salaah will be incomplete." However. the Muhadditheen, especially Imaam Ahmad RAH. who is the Imaam of Muhadditheen state that this Hadith refers to the person who is performing salaah by himself and is not following an Imaam. When this is the meaning of the Hadith, it will therefore be implausible to assert that it restricts the purport of the verse of the Qur'aan, especially when Imaam Bayhaqi RAH. has stated that the verse was revealed with reference to salaah. Sheikhu'l Islaam Hadhrat Moulana Husayn Ahmad Madani RAH. says that there are several apparent points of rationale making the Hanafi point of view evident. The first is that there are no narrations stating without ambiguity that it is Waajib (compulsory) to recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam. Since this is an act that happens ever so often and is of such importance, the absence of a clear narration makes it evident that it is not Waajib (compulsory) for the Muqtadi to recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam.

The second point is that if reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam was Waajib (compulsory), there needs to be a time within the salaah when he ought to be reciting. The Imaam would then be instructed when to pause his Qiraa'ah so that the Muqtadi may recite. There is however no such instruction mentioned. This proves that Qiraa'ah is not Waajib (compulsory) for the Muqtadi because why would the time not be mentioned for something that is compulsory when times are mentioned for things that are Mustahab, such as saying RABBANA LAKAL HAMD and Aameen.

1. With regard to the Hadith of Hadhrat Ubaadah RADI., Imaam Sufyana bin Uyaynah RAH. and Imaam Ahmad RAH. both state that it does not refer to the Muqtadi. The Hadith therefore does not apply to all people performing salaah and regarding it to be such will result in contradicting narrations such as "unless he is behind an Imaam" and "If one has an Imaam, then the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam is his Qiraa'ah as well." Adopting the approach of the Hanafis will prevent assuming such a contradiction because each Hadith will have an independent application; one referring to the Muqtadi and the other to the Munfarid.

2. Most of the Sahabah RADI. and all of the A'immah maintain that the person who joins the Imaam only in Ruku has made it for the Rakaah. This is also established from a Hadith in which Rasulullaah SAW. said, "If you come for salaah and find us in Sajdah, make the Sajdah but do not count it. As for the one who makes it for the Ruku, he has made it for the Rakaah. Now the person joining only in the Ruku does not recite Surah Faatiha, yet even those who claim that Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam is Waajib say that the person has made it for the Rakaah. They are constrained to say this because of this clear-cut Hadith.

3. While people use the Hadith "There is no salaah for the one who does not recite the opening of the Kitaab (Surah Faatiha)" to substantiate their claim. This Hadith is reported with the addition of the words "and more".? This means that there is no salaah for the one who does not recite Surah Faatiha and more (additional verses of the Qur'aan). This addition has been narrated by Imaam Muslim RAH. (Vol.1 Pg. 167)

Although some Muhadditheen say that the narrator Hadhrat Ma'mar RAH. is the only one who has reported the addition, they are mistaken because other reliable narrators have also reported it. Examples of such narrators are Hadhrat Sufyaan bin Uyayah RAH. in a narration of Abu Dawood, narrating from Imaam Zuhri RAH. Hadhrat Saalih bin Kaysaan RAH., Imaam Awzaa'ee RAH., Hadhrat Abdur Rahmaan bin Is'haaq RAH. and others have also reported the same addition as Hadhrat Ma'mar RAH.

This addition is also substantiated in other Ahadeeth, such as a narration from Hadhrat Abu Sa'eed Khudri RADI. in which he states. "Rasulullaah SAW. instructed us to recite Surah Faatiha and whatever else of the Qur'aan that is easy for us." Another narration states that Rasulullaah SAW. said, "There is no salaah for the one who does not recite the opening of the Kitaab (Surah Faatiha) and some more. The following narrations also reinforce this:

Hadhrat Abu Hurayrah RADI. reports that Rasulullaah SAW. instructed him to announce that there is no salaah for the one who does not recite the opening of the Kitaab (surah Faatiha) and some more.

Hadhrat Abu Sa'eed Khudri RADI. narrates that Rasulullaah SAW. said, "There is no salaah for the one who does not recite Surah Faatiha and a Surah in every Rakaah of the Fardh (obligatory) and other salaahs.

The above narrations tell us that the recitation of Surah Faatiha together with another few verses of the Qur'aan should be Fardh (obligatory), whereas this is not the case even according to those who claim that reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam is necessary. Now why would they practice on one part of the Hadith and forsake the other without any justification? This reinforces the viewpoint of the Hanafis that reciting Qiraa'ah is not necessary for the Muqtadi; but it is Waajib (compulsory) for the Imaam and the Munfarid to recite Surah Faatiha together with a Surah or a few verses of the Qur'aan.

The gist of it all is that it is wrong to claim that it is Waajib (compulsory) for the Muqtadi to recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam because just as the Sutra of the Imaam suffices for the Muqtadi, so too does the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam suffice for the Muqtadi whether it be during audible or silent salaahs. It is therefore clear that it is wrong to claim that the view of the Hanafi Madh'hab is wrong.

It is believed that Hadhrat Imaam Shaafi'ee RAH. was of the opinion that it is Waajib (compulsory) for the Muqtadi to reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam in all types of salaah. However, in his final and famous work Kitaabul Umm, he has the following to say: "It is Waajib (compulsory) for the Munfarid and the Imaam to recite Surah Faatiha in every Rakaah. No other Surah will suffice in its place. I also prefer that a verse or more of the Qur'aan be recited with it. I shall soon mention the ruling with regard to the Muqtadi, Inshaa Allaah.

He then states the ruling of the Muqtadi in volume when he says, "We state that the Muqtadi should reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam in every salaah in which the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam cannot be heard.

This statement of Imaam Shaafi'ee RAH. makes it apparent that it is incorrect for the Muqtadi to recite Surah Faatiha behind the Imaam when performing the audible salaahs. He has specified that Qiraa'ah be recited behind the Imaam only in the silent salaahs.

To compete the above reply, it is appropriate to cite the words of Hadhrat Moulana Idrees Kandhalwi RAH., which will shed further light on the issue. While I had originally intended to give a brief reply to this question, the reply has become lengthy and although the following would add to the body of tire reply, I have decided to include it because it is so beneficial. Had I seen this earlier, I would have sufficed by quoting it after a brief reply.

Hadhrat Moulana writes that according to Imaam Abu Haneefah RAH. it is not permissible for the Muqtadi to recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam regardless of whether the salaah is silent or audible. It is by their deduction that Imaams Ahmad RAH. and Malik RAH. differentiate between the silent and audible salaahs. As has been stated, the verse of the Qur'aan (..When the Qur'aan is recited, then listen attentively to it and remain silent"), it refers to both silent and audible salaahs. The Ahadeeth of Rasulullaah SAW. exhorting silence and attentive listening do not differentiate between silent and audible salaahs. Rasulullaah SAW. expressed displeasure at the Sahabah RADI.'s recitation behind him when it occurred during the Fajr salaah and also during the Zuhr salaah. He used the word "wrestling" as well as "confusing" when admonishing the Sahabah RADI. for reciting Qiraa'ah behind him. There was no differentiation between silent

and audible salaahs

In fact, a report states that Rasulullaah SAW. once led the Sahabah RADI. the Asr salaah. When one of the Sahabah RADI. started to recite Qiraa'ah, the Sahabi RADI. beside him indicated to him to remain silent. When the salaah was over. the Sahabi RADI. asked 'Why did you indicate to me to remain silent?' The other replied, 'Rasulullaah SAW. was in front of us and I did not want you to recite behind him. Overhearing this conversation, Rasulullaah SAW. then said, 'if one has an Imaam, then the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam is his Qiraa'ah as well.

This means that there is no need for the Muqtadi reciting Qiraa'ah because the Imaam is already doing so. This is similar to the verse of the Qur'aan in which Allaah says: "Does it not suffice for them that we have revealed the Book to you." This tells us that when the Qur'aan suffices to guide mankind, there is no need for another scripture.

The above narration makes it evident that reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam is an act that is disliked since Rasulullaah SAW. endorsed the words of the Sahabi RADI. This incident took place during the Asr salaah. Which is a silent salaah, making it clear that the ruling does not change from salaah to salaah.

Rasaa'ilul Arkaan (Vol.1 Pg.101) states that the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam suffices for the follower according to the Hanafi, Hambali and Maaliki schools of jurisprudence.

The proof stems from the Hadith of Hadhrat Jaabir RADI. in which Rasulullaah SAW. said, "When a person has an Imaam, then the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam is his Qiraa'ah as well." This Hadith is Sahih (authentic) and has been narrated by Imaam Abu Haneefah RAH. Imaam Muhammad RAH. has stated in his Mu'atta that Imaam Abu Haneefah RAH. has reported it to him and Ibn Adi RAH. has also reported it through his own chain of narrators from Imaam Abu Haneefah RAH. Allaama Ibn Jowzi RAH. has ruled that the narration is Sahih. The details have been elaborated upon in Fat'hul Qadeer together with the chains of narrators. Both chains of narrators end at Rasulullaah SAW., the one from Imaam Abu Haneefah RAH. being the more authentic of the two. Our practice in this matter has proven from the practices of eminent Sahabah RADI.

Haafidh Ibn Taymiyyah RAH. whom the Ghayr Muqallideen claim to follow, writes, "The issue is a bone of contention from both camps, but those who prohibit reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam are the majority of scholars from the past and the present. They have the Qur'aan and authentic Ahadeeth to back their claim whereas those who claim that it is Waajib (compulsory)

for the Muqtadi to recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam have in their support Ahadeeth that the A'immah have declared to be weak. Tafseer Haqqaani reports a narration from Hadhrat Abu Hurayrah RADI. stating that after leading the salaah on one occasion, Rasulullaah SAW. asked the Sahabah RADI. anyone had recited Qiraa'ah behind him. When the Sahabah RADI. replied that someone did, Rasulullaah SAW. remarked, "I did feel that someone was wrestling with me in reciting." From that day onwards, the Sahabah RADI. no longer recited Qiraa'ah behind Rasulullaah SAW. in the audible salaahs. Tirmidhi has declared the Hadith as Hasan. The same type of narration has been reported from Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood RADI., Hadhrat Imraan bin Husayn RADI. and Hadhrat Jaabir bin Abdullaah RADI.

Muslim has also reported a narration in which Rasulullaah SAW. said, "The Imaam has been appointed to be followed..." This Hadith adds that Rasulullaah SAW. also said, "...so be silent when he recites the Qiraa'ah." Furthermore, Hadhrat Jaabir RADI. said, "Whoever performs a Rakaah without reciting the mother of the Qur'aan (Surah Faatiha) has performed no salaah unless he is behind an Imaam." This Hadith has been declared to be Hasan Sahih. Imaam Tahaawi RAH. has reported these words from Rasulullaah SAW. and several Muhadditheen including Imaams Ahmad RAH. and Maafik RAH. have also reported it.

Apart from the above, there are several other narrations from Imaam Muhammad RAH. and Ibn Abi Shaybah RAH. substantiating the view that reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam is prohibited. It is in view of all of this that Imaam Abu Haneefah RAH. has instructed Muqtadis to remain silent when following the Imaam. Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Mas'ood RADI. Hadhrat Jaabir RADI. and Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Umar RADI. also did not recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam.

Imaam Shaafi'ee RAH. and other Muhadditheen have emphasised the recitation of Surah Faatiha. However, they say that the Muqtadi will recite it only when the Imaam pauses after reciting it first. They prove their opinion by quoting a Hadith in which Rasulullaah SAW. said, "Whoever performs salaah without reciting the mother of the Qur'aan, his salaah will be incomplete." However, the Muhadditheen, especially Imaam Ahmad RAH. who is the Imaam of Muhadditheen state that this Hadith refers to the person who is performing salaah by himself and is not following an Imaam. When this is the meaning of the Hadith, it will therefore be implausible to assert that it restricts the purport of the verse of the Qur'aan, especially when Imaam Bayhaqi RAH. has stated that the verse was revealed with reference to salaah.

Sheikhul Islaam Hadhrat Moulana Husayn Ahmad Madani RAH. says that there are several apparent points of rationale making the Hanafi point of view evident. The first is that there are no narrations stating without ambiguity that it is Waajib (compulsory) to recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam. Since this is an act that happens ever so often and is of such importance, the

absence of a clear narration makes it evident that it is not Waajib (compulsory) for the Muqtadi to recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam.

The second point is that if reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam was Waajib (compulsory), there needs to be a time within the salaah when he ought to be reciting. The Imaam would then be instructed when to pause his Qiraa'ah so that the Muqtadi may recite. There is however no such instruction mentioned. This proves that Qiraa'ah is not Waajib (compulsory) for the Muqtadi because why would the time not be mentioned for something that is compulsory when times are mentioned for things that are Mustahab, such as saying RABBANA LAKAL HAMD and Aameen.

1. With regard to the Hadith of Hadhrat Ubaadah RADI., Imaam Sufyana bin Uyaynah RAH. and Imaam Ahmad RAH. both state that it does not refer to the Muqtadi. The Hadith therefore does not apply to all people performing salaah and regarding it to be such will result in contradicting narrations such as "unless he is behind an Imaam" and "If one has an Imaam, then the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam is his Qiraa'ah as well." Adopting the approach of the Hanafis will prevent assuming such a contradiction because each Hadith will have an independent application; one referring to the Muqtadi and the other to the Munfarid.

2. Most of the Sahabah RADI. and all of the A'immah maintain that the person who joins the Imaam only in Ruku has made it for the Rakaah. This is also established from a Hadith in which Rasulullah SAW. said "If you come for salah and find us in sajdah, make the sajdah but do not count it. As for the one who makes it for the Ruku, he has made it for the Rakaah. Now the person joining only in the Ruku does not recite Surah Faatiha, yet even those who claim that Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam is Waajib say that the person has made it for the Rakaah. They are constrained to say this because of this clear-cut Hadith.

3. While people use the Hadith "There is no salaah for the one who does not recite the opening of the Kitaab (Surah Faatiha)" to substantiate their claim. this Hadith is reported with the addition of the words "and more". This means that there is no salaah for the one who does not recite Surah Faatiha and more (additional verses of the Qur'aan). This addition has been narrated by Imaam Muslim RAH. (Vol.1 Pg. 167)

Although some Muhadditheen say that the narrator Hadhrat Ma'mar RAH. is the only one who has reported the addition, they are mistaken because other reliable narrators have also reported it. Examples of such narrators are Hadhrat Sufyaan bin Uyayah RAH. in a narration of Abu Dawood, narrating from Imaam Zuhri RAH. Hadhrat Saalih bin Kaysaan RAH., Imaam

Awzaa'ee RAH., Hadhrat Abdur Rahmaan bin Is'haaq RAH. and others have also reported the same addition as Hadhrat Ma'mar RAH.

This addition is also substantiated in other Ahadeeth, such as a narration from Hadhrat Abu Sa'eed Khudri RADI. in which he states."Rasulullaah SAW. instructed us to recite Surah Faatiha and whatever else of the Qur'aan that is easy for us." Another narration states that Rasulullaah SAW. said, "There is no salaah for the one who does not recite the opening of the Kitaab (Surah Faatiha) and some more. The following narrations also reinforce this: Hadhrat Abu Hurayrah RADI. reports that Rasulullaah SAW. instructed him to announce that there is no salaah for the one who does not recite the opening of the Kitaab (surah Faatiha) and some more.

Hadhrat Abu Sa'eed Khudri RADI. narrates that Rasulullaah SAW. said. "There is no salaah for the one who does not recite Surah Faatiha and a Surah in every Rakaah of the Fardh (obligatory) and other salaahs.

The above narrations tell us that the recitation of Surah Faatiha together with another few verses of the Qur'aan should be Fardh (obligatory), whereas this is not the case even according to those who claim that reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam is necessary. Now why would they practice on one part of the Hadith and forsake the other without any justification? This reinforces the viewpoint of the Hanafis that reciting Qiraa'ah is not necessary for the Muqtadi; but it is Waajib (compulsory) for the Imaam and the Munfarid to recite Surah Faatiha together with a Surah or a few verses of the Qur'aan.

The gist of it all is that it is wrong to claim that it is Waajib (compulsory) for the Muqtadi to recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam because just as the Sutra of the Imaam suffices for the Muqtadi, so too does the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam suffice for the Muqtadi whether it be during audible or silent salaahs. It is therefore clear that it is wrong to claim that the view of the Hanafi Madh'hab is wrong.

It is believed that Hadhrat Imaam Shaafi'ee RAH. was of the opinion that it is Waajib (compulsory) for the Muqtadi to reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam in all types of salaah. However, in his final and famous work Kitaabul Umm, he has the following to say: "It is Waajib (compulsory) for the Munfarid and the Imaam to recite Surah Faatiha in every Rakaah. No other Surah will suffice in its place. I also prefer that a verse or more of the Qur'aan be recited with it. I shall soon mention the ruling with regard to the Muqtadi, Inshaa Allaah.

He then states the ruling of the Muqtadi in volume when he says, "We state that the Muqtadi should reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam in every salaah in which the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam cannot be heard.

This statement of Imaam Shaafi'ee RAH. makes it apparent that it is incorrect for the Muqtadi to recite Surah Faatiha behind the Imaam when performing the audible salaahs. He has specified that Qiraa'ah be recited behind the Imaam only in the silent salaahs.

To complete the above reply, it is appropriate to cite the words of Hadhrat Moulana Idrees Kandhalwi RAH., which will shed further light on the issue. While I had originally intended to give a brief reply to this question, the reply has become lengthy and although the following would add to the body of tire reply, I have decided to include it because it is so beneficial. Had I seen this earlier, I would have sufficed by quoting it after a brief reply.

Hadhrat Moulana writes that according to Imaam Abu Haneefah RAH. it is not permissible for the Muqtadi to recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam regardless of whether the salaah is silent or audible. It is by their deduction that Imaams Ahmad RAH. and Maalik RAH. differentiate between the silent and audible salaahs. As has been stated, the verse of the Qur'aan (..When the Qur'aan is recited, then listen attentively to it and remain silent"), it refers to both silent and audible salaahs. The Ahadeeth of Rasulullaah SAW. exhorting silence and attentive listening do not differentiate between silent and audible salaahs. Rasulullaah SAW. expressed displeasure at the Sahabah RADI.'s recitation behind him when it occurred during the Fajr salaah and also during the Zuhr salaah. He used the word "wrestling" as well as "confusing" when admonishing the Sahabah RADI. for reciting Qiraa'ah behind him. There was no differentiation between silent and audible salaahs

In fact, a report states that Rasulullaah SAW. once led the Sahabah RADI. the Asr salaah. When one of the Sahabah RADI. started to recite Qiraa'ah, the Sahabi RADI. beside him indicated to him to remain silent. When the salaah was over. the Sahabi RADI. asked 'Why did you indicate to me to remain silent?' The other replied, 'Rasulullaah SAW. was in front of us and I did not want you to recite behind him. Overhearing this conversation, Rasulullaah SAW. then said, 'if one has an Imaam, then the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam is his Qiraa'ah as well.

This means that there is no need for the Muqtadi reciting Qiraa'ah because the Imaam is already doing so. This is similar to the verse of the Qur'aan in which Allaah says: "Does it not suffice for them that we have revealed the Book to you." This tells us that when the Qur'aan suffices to guide mankind, there is no need for another scripture.

The above narration makes it evident that reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam is an act that is disliked since Rasulullaah SAW. endorsed the words of the Sahabi RADI. This incident took place during the Asr salaah, which is a silent salaah, making it clear that the ruling does not change from salaah to salaah.

It is this what Hadhrat Jaabir RAH. stated in a Hadith that is authentic without any doubt. The same has been stated by Hadhrat Abu Dardaa RADI. when he quotes that Rasulullaah SAW. said. "When the Imaam recites Qiraa'ah, it will certainly suffice for the Muqtadi.

THE KHULAFAA RAASHIDEEN: Hadhrat Moosa bin Aqaba RADI.says that Rasulullaah SAW., Hadhrat Abu Bakr RADI., Hadhrat Umar RADI. and Hadhrat Uthmaan RADI. all prevented people from reciting Qiraa'ah when following the Imaam.' Haafidh Ayni RAH. states that this narration is authentic.

HADHRAT UMAR RADI. Imaam Muhammad RAH. quotes Hadhrat Umar RADI. as saying, "I wish that stones could be filled into the mouth of the person who recites Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam."

HADHRAT ALI RADI. Hadhrat Ali RADI. said, "The one who recites when following the Imaam conflicts with Fitrah.

We have thus far concentrated on research findings and examining narrations of Ahadeeth because the nature of the subject is one dealing with Fiqh and Ahadeeth.

The following is quoted from Nasa'ee: Interpreting the verse 'When the Qur'aan is recited, then listen attentively to it and remain silent so that mercy may be shown to You.', Hadhrat Abu Hurayrah RADI. said, 'Rasulullaah SAW. said, 'The Imaam has been appointed to be followed, so call out the Takbeer Tahreema when he does, be silent when he recites the Qiraa'ah and say (ALLAAHUMMA RABBANAA LAKAL HAMD) when he says (SAMIALLAA HULIMAN HAMID) This Hadith makes it clear that it is Waajib (compulsory) for the Muqtadi to remain silent and to listen attentively to the recitation of the Imaam and it does not specify the silence for the Surah only.

A FINE POINT: A fine line of difference between the verse of Surah A'raaf and the Hadith is that while the Hadith speaks about remaining silent, the verse of the Qur'aan speaks about both remaining silent as well as listening attentively. This is because the Qur'aan is sometimes recited silently and sometimes audibly. The ruling when the Qiraa'ah is audible is to listen attentively and when it is silent, the ruling is to remain silent. The purpose of the verse is to expound the rulings applicable to Qiraa'ah, whereas the purpose of the Hadith is to expound the ruling with regards to the Muqtadi. It instructs the Muqtadi to remain silent regardless of whether the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam is audible or not and whether the Muqtadi is listening attentively or not. The Hadith therefore mentions only the instruction to remain silent, without any reference to attentive listening.

In fact, from the very beginning when salaah was made Fardh (obligatory) up to the time that

Rasulullaah SAW. passed away, it has always been the practice for the Imaam to recite the Qiraa'ah and for the Muqtadi to listen in silence. When some Sahabah RADI. decided to recite Qiraa'ah behind Rasulullaah SAW. out of their own discretion, they were prevented from doing so by the revelation of the verse "When the Qur'aan is recited, then listen attentively to it and remain silent so that mercy may be shown to you". Even when Rasulullaah SAW. went to Masjidul Aqsa before leaving for the Mi'raaj, all the Ambiyaa ALY. and the high-ranking angels waited for him to lead the salaah and none of them recited Surah Faatiha as Rasulullaah SAW. recited the Qiraa'ah in salaah.

When someone did reciting Qiraa'ah behind Rasulullaah SAW. he asked, "It appears that some of you are reciting Qiraa'ah behind your Imaam?" It is therefore evident that Rasulullaah SAW. never instructed or encouraged reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam.

When Rasulullaah SAW. was suffering his final illness, he had instructed Hadhrat Abu Bakr RADI. to lead the salaahs. As Hadhrat Abu Bakr RADI. was leading the Fajr salaah, Rasulullaah SAW. was feeling a bit better and arrived in the Masjid. Hadhrat Abu Bakr RADI. then stepped back and Rasulullaah SAW. proceeded to lead the salaah, continuing the Qiraa'ah from where Hadhrat Abu Bakr RADI. had left off. Hadhrat Abu Bakr RADI. was then busy reciting a Surah. Rasulullaah SAW. therefore did not recite Surah Faatiha in this final salaah that he led or any of the Qiraa'ah that Hadhrat Abu Bakr RADI. has already recited.

The Qiraa'ah of Hadhrat Abu Bakr RADI. sufficed for all, just as Rasulullaah SAW. said, "If one has an Imaam, then the Qiraa'ah of the Imaam is his Qiraa'ah as well." There are therefore two types of Qiraa'ah according to this Hadith; Qiraa'ah Haqeeqi (actual Qiraa'ah) and Qiraa'ah Hukmi (Qiraa'ah that is not actual Qiraa'ah, but in shares the same status).

Therefore, if it is assumed that Rasulullaah SAW. referred to both the Imaam and Muqtadi when he said, "There is no salaah for the one who does not recite the opening of the Kitaab", then it will be necessary to assume that it also refers to both the types of Qiraa'ah. According to this interpretation, the Qiraa'ah of the Muqtadi in this Hadith with refer to the Qiraa'ah Hukmi because Rasulullaah SAW. said, "If one has an Imaam, then the Qiraa'ah? the Imaam is his Qiraa'ah as well." This Qiraa'ah Hukmi takes place when the Muqtadi remains silent and listens attentively to the Imaam. By remaining silent. the Muqtadi will therefore be practising on both the verse of the Qur'aan enjoining silence as well as the Hadith invoking Qiraa'ah Hukmi. As for the person who recites Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam, he will be guilty of acting in conflict with the verse of the Qur'aan as well as wrestling with the Imaam, which Rasulullaah SAW. prohibited. Had Rasulullaah SAW. ever instructed the Sahabah RADI. to reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam, he would never have reproached the Sahabi RADI. in question.

UPON FURTHER DELIBERATION: The purpose of Qiraa'ah is either to listen to the commands of Allaah or to engage in conversation with Allaah. If the former is the purpose, then the Imaam is Allaah's ambassador to convey the commands to the people and if it is the latter. then the Imaam is the people's representative before Allaah, who will present the supplications of the people to Him. It is obvious that an ambassador or a representative can be one person only. He will be the Imaam and the Muqtadis will say Aameen to his Qiraa'ah. As for the etiquette of

worship which includes the Ruku, Sajdah, Tasbeeh and the other postures and acts of the salaah, these are necessary for both the Imaam and the Muqtadis. Representation is not applicable here because the purpose of these acts is to revere Allaah, which is incumbent on every individual. The plea for guidance to the straight path that is stated in Surah Faatiha is adequately presented by the Imaam who represents the entire congregation.

FURTHERMORE: A study of the Qur'aan and Ahadeeth will reveal that the salaah in Jamaa'ah is really a single salaah, which is the salaah of the Imaam. The salaah of the Muqtadis fall within his salaah. It is for this reason that if the Imaam's salaah is nullified, the salaah of the Muqtadis will be nullified, whereas an act on their part nullifying the salaah will not nullify the Imaam's and their salaah. Similarly, the Sutra of the Imaam will suffice for the Jamaa'ah and preceding the Imaam in any posture is prohibited.

In fact, when the Qur'aan refers to salaah in Jamaa'ah, it refers to one salaah. Examples of this are the verses: "When they stand up for salaah, they stand up lazily" and "When you present yourselves for the salaah, do not approach it in a drunken state". The singular use of the word salaah indicates that the salaah in Jamaa'ah is one.

Therefore, if every Muqtadi has to reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam, the salaah will not be one, but it will be several people performing their individual salaahs in one place. This then cannot be termed salaah in Jamaa'ah.

A narration from Hadhrat Abdullaah bin Abbaas RADI. states that when Rasulullaah SAW. used to lead the Sahabah RADI. in salaah during their stay in Makkah, he would recite the Qur'aan loudly, hearing which the Mushrikeen used to swear at the Qur'aan and the One who revealed the Qur'aan. It was then that Allaah revealed the verse "Do not recite (the Qur'aan) loudly in your salaah nor softly, but seek a path in between these (two extremes)". This verse instructs the Imaam to recite in a manner that the Muqtadis can hear because it is their duty to listen and not to recite.

EXPLAINING THE HADITH OF HADHRAT UBAADAH RADI.

The strongest proof for reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam (as stated by Imaam Shaafi RAH.) is the Hadith of Hadhrat Ubaadah RADI. stating, "There is no salaah for the one who does not

recite the opening of the Kitaab (Surah Faatiha)."

In response, the reply from Imaam Abu Haneefah RAH. will be that the Hadith in question does not specify the Muqtadi. On the other hand, the verse of Surah A'raaf (When the Qur'aan is recited, then listen attentively to it and remain silent so that mercy may be shown to you) was revealed with explicit reference to the Muqtadi. Furthermore, those Sahabah RADI. who reciting Qiraa'ah behind Rasulullaah SAW. were reprimanded.

Now it is a principle with Imaam Shaafi'ee RAH. that a verse of the Qur'aan with an unspecified meaning may be made specific with a solitary narration of Hadith. It will therefore be obvious that a solitary narration of Hadith with an unspecified meaning may be made specific with a verse of the Qur'aan.

Furthermore, there are also several Ahadeeth that refer specifically to the Muqtadi. Amongst these is the Hadith "When any of you performs salaah behind an Imaam, the recitation of the Imaam suffices for him as well." This narration is authentic and complies with the standards of authenticity as specified by Imaams Bukhaari RAH. and Muslim RAH. It is therefore Apparent that the Hadith of Hadhrat Ubaadah RADI. refers to the Imaam and the Munfarid, as stated by the teacher of Imaam Shaafi'ee RAH. Hadhrat Sufyaan bin Uyaynah RAH. and reported in the Sunan of Imaam Abu Dawood RAH. Emphasising the same is the narration of Tirmidhi in which Hadhrat Jaabir RADI. said, "Whoever performs a Rakaah without reciting the mother of the Qur'aan (Surah Faatiha) has performed no salaah unless he is behind an Imaam."

Imaam Tirmidhi RAH. states that according to Imaam Ahmad RAH. (who taught Imaam Bukhaari RAH., the Hadith of Hadhrat Ubaadah RAH. does not refer to the Muqtadi but to the person performing salaah by himself. He proves this by citing the above narration of Hadhrat Jaabir? RAH. which explains that Surah Faatiha is not to be recited if one is following an Imaam.

Imaam Ahmad bin Hambal RAH. said, 'We have never heard anyone from the people of Islaam state that the Muqtadi's salaah is invalid when he does not recite Qiraa'ah as the Imaam does in the audible salaahs. This has never been stated by Rasulullaah SAW., the Sahabah RADI., the Taabi'een. Imaam Maalik RAH. from the people of Hijaaz, Imaam Thowri RAH. from the people of Iraq, Imaam Awzaa'ee RAH. from the people of Shaam or Imaam Layth bin Sa'd RAH. from the people of Egypt. None has ever stated that the salaah of the follow is invalid when he does not recite Qiraa'ah.

It has therefore been noted that none of the Sahabah RADI. Taabi'een or pious predecessors advocated reciting Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam in audible salaahs. In fact, Imaam Tirmidhi RAH. notes that Imaam Shaafi'ee RAH. had swayed too much to the extreme when he declared it Waajib (compulsory) for the Muqtadi to recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam. Even Imaam Ibn Taymiyyah RAH. has emphasised that it is not permissible and Haraam for a Muqtadi to recite Qiraa'ah behind the Imaam during audible salaahs. Those people in today's times who claim to be followers of the Ahadeeth (Ahle Hadrth) should study the Fataawaa of Allaama Ibn Taymiyyah RAH.

IN A NUTSHELL

The opinion of Imaam Abu Haneefah RAH. is extremely well substantiated by the Qur'aan and Ahadeeth. It also appeals perfectly with logic and common sense. One may refer to the detailed commentaries of Hidaayah and Bukhaari for the details.

Fatawa Rahimiyyah vol.2