Q: 346 - Title: Why is it Haraam to say "Ya Muhammad"?

Question

Why saying YA Muhammad is consider Shirk or Haram? Some scholars say that saying YA Muhammad is shirk or haram because of the prefix 'Ya' means present since the prophet is not present everywhere that's why it is considered Haram?
But According to Arabic Grammar prefix YA can be used for both near and far person (Jaamin Durood Arabin vol.2 pg.106). Then Why it is said so?

Answer:

In the Name of Allah, the Most Gracious, the Most Merciful.

As-salamu 'alaykum wa-rahmatullahi wa-barakatuh.

In principle, if one says 'Ya Rasool al-Allah' or 'Ya Muhammed' with the belief that Rasullullah (Sallallahu Alayhi Wa Sallam) hears every sound, sees every action, etc, then it is impermissible and constitutes Shirk (polytheism).

If one believes that the words 'Ya Rasullullah' or 'Ya Muhammed' are being sent to Rasullullah (Sallallahu Alayhi Wa Sallam) via the angels in the form of Durood and Salaam, then it is permissible for one to say such words.

However, if one utters such wordings out of extreme love for Rasullullah (Sallallahu Alayhi Wa Sallam) without the incorrect belief that Rasullullah (Sallallahu Alayhi Wa Sallam) listens to every word, sees us, etc, then it is merely Mubah (permissible) for one to utter such words.

Nevertheless, since many people have the incorrect belief that Rasullullah (Sallallahu Alayhi Wa Sallam) is Hadhir and Nadhir (omnipresent), knower of the unseen or that Rasullullah (Sallalalhu Alayhi Wa Sallam) listens to one who pronounces the words 'Ya Muhammed' or 'Ya Rasullullah', it is highly advisable that one refrains from uttering such words.

The reference that you have quoted is unclear. In all probability, you are referring to "Jami al-Duroos al-Arabiyyah".

And Allah Ta'ala Knows Best

Ismail Desai,
Student Darul Iftaa
Durban, South Africa

Checked and Concurred by,
Moulana Abdul Azeem Bin Abdul Rahmaan

Student Darul Iftaa